

UNIVERSITY OF DELAWARE
 Department of Philosophy


Survival Lottery

MARK GREENE
 Department of Philosophy
 University of Delaware

mkgreene@udel.edu
www.vole.org

The Survival Lottery:
 Exegesis - picking a paper apart

- Thesis
 - Main point
 - Exact point very nuanced
- What do you think?
- Argument
 - Overall strategy
 - Examine each move



So what is the main point?

- We should adopt a survival lottery?
- We should adopt a survival lottery if transplantation is perfected?
- ...?

- A thesis statement
 - In principle...
 - Utilitarians should approve
 - Others have no good grounds to gripe
- Assumes equivalence of killing & letting die

And what is the strategy?

- Proof by cases?
- Reductio ad absurdum?
- Syllogism?
- Analogy?
- Ad hominem?
- Some combination?

- Presumptive case
 - It saves more lives!!
- Intuition pump
- Defeat challenges

Playing burden tennis

- Pushing the (green fuzzy) burden of proof back to your opponent
- Try to place it where it will be difficult to return to you



UNIVERSITY OF DELAWARE
 Department of Philosophy
 Mark Greene
 mkgreene@udel.edu

Philosophy gives the means to speak with apparent authority on all matters, and to make oneself admired by the less learned; while law, medicine and the other sciences bring honor and riches upon their practitioners.

- Rene Descartes, Discourse on Method

