

UNIVERSITY OF DELAWARE  
 Department of Philosophy

## Survival Lottery

MARK GREENE  
 Department of Philosophy  
 University of Delaware  
[mkgreene@udel.edu](mailto:mkgreene@udel.edu)  
[www.vale.org](http://www.vale.org)

---

---

---

---

---


---

---

---

### The Survival Lottery: Exegesis - picking a paper apart

- Thesis
  - Main point
  - Exact point very nuanced
- What do you think?
- Argument
  - Overall strategy
  - Examine each move




---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### So what is the main point?

- We should adopt a survival lottery?
- We should adopt a survival lottery if transplantation is perfected?
- ...?
- A thesis statement
  - In principle...
    - Utilitarians should approve
    - Others have no good grounds to gripe
  - Assumes equivalence of killing & letting die

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**And what is the strategy?**

- Proof by cases?
- Reductio ad absurdum?
- Syllogism?
- Analogy?
- Ad hominem?
- Some combination?

- Presumptive case
  - It saves more lives!!
- Intuition pump
- Defeat challenges

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**Playing burden tennis**

- Pushing the (green fuzzy) burden of proof back to your opponent
- Try to place it where it will be difficult to return to you




---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

UNIVERSITY OF DELAWARE  
 Department of Philosophy  
 Mark Greene  
 mkgreene@udel.edu

Philosophy gives the means to speak with apparent authority on all matters, and to make oneself admired by the less learned; while law, medicine and the other sciences bring honor and riches upon their practitioners.

– Rene Descartes, Discourse on Method

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---